



Evaluation Of The Textbook "My Best Reading" Based On The Instrument By Mike Horsley And Kevin Laws

Abdul Syahid^{1*}, Iffa Kharimah², Umi Maisarah³, Meisya Rawenda⁴, Kholida Ziya⁵

^{1,2,3,4}Tadris Bahasa Inggris, Institut Agama Islam Negeri Palangka Raya,

Email: ¹abdul.syahid@iain-palangkaraya.ac.id , ²syifaprg@gmail.com , ³maisarahumi14@gmail.com ,

⁴meisyarawendameisya@gmail.com , ⁵Kholidaziya09@gmail.com

Abstract

This study discusses the importance of textbook evaluation in education to ensure the quality and effectiveness of the learning process. Textbooks not only present information but also assist teachers in designing the curriculum, crafting learning activities, and assessing student progress. Therefore, a comprehensive evaluation of textbooks is crucial to assess their suitability for educational needs. This research adopts a descriptive qualitative approach and utilizes the evaluation instrument developed by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws to evaluate the "My Best Reading" textbook. The evaluation results provide valuable insights into the strengths and weaknesses of the textbook and its contribution to improving the quality of educational materials. However, the study has limitations that need to be considered in designing more comprehensive recommendations for enhancing instructional materials.

Keyword : Textbook evaluation, educational quality, learning effectiveness, evaluation instrument, educational needs.

INTRODUCTION

In education, the evaluation of educational materials plays an important role in ensuring the quality and effectiveness of the teaching and learning process. Textbooks serve as a basic resource in shaping students' understanding and proficiency in various subjects. Rather than simply presenting information, textbooks play a key role in helping teachers structure the curriculum, design learning activities and assess student learning progress. Therefore, a thorough assessment of textbooks is crucial to gauge their suitability for the purposes of education (Julaeha and Zaqiah 2021). This evaluation makes it possible to identify the strengths and weaknesses of a textbook, ensure that the material presented is in line with established curriculum standards, and assess the extent to which the textbook can effectively accommodate students' learning needs. Thus, textbook evaluation is not just a process of assessing its quality, but also a crucial step in enhancing students' learning experience and improving the overall quality of education.

A thorough assessment of textbooks is crucial to gauge their suitability for educational purposes. It is necessary, then, to be able to examine textbooks carefully to ensure that the content, exercises and guidelines are in line with what is to be achieved in the learning process. When teachers select and use textbooks, they are actually selecting learning tools that will shape the way students understand the material. This also means that the quality of textbooks affects not only the quality of teaching, but also student learning outcomes (Darmuki and Ayuningsih 2022). If textbooks provide clear information, meaningful exercises and appropriate guidance, the learning process will be more effective. Conversely, inadequate textbooks can hinder students' understanding and limit their progress in achieving learning objectives. By understanding the importance of evaluating textbooks and ensuring that they meet educational needs, we can increase students' learning opportunities and improve the overall quality of education (Sholeh and Junaris 2023).

By incorporating sociocultural theories of literacy and considering Malaysia's multilingual context, the MREQ offers a holistic tool to assess not only reading proficiency but also the emotional and experiential dimensions of literacy practices. Therefore, integrating insights from the MREQ into the evaluation of educational materials, such as 'My Best Reading,' can offer educators and curriculum developers valuable perspectives on enhancing students' reading experiences and literacy development (Lin, Mohamed and Ismail 2016).

By incorporating insights from these studies, this evaluation aims to shed light on the importance of integrating higher-order thinking skills in ELT materials, particularly in the context of reading comprehension. The assessment of 'My Best Reading' textbook using the framework proposed by Horsley and Laws will provide valuable insights into its effectiveness in promoting reading skills and catering to diverse learning needs. Through this evaluation, we aim to contribute to the enhancement of educational materials and the advancement of reading instruction practices in English language classrooms (Nakkam and Khamoja 2020).

In recent years, educators and researchers have increasingly recognized the importance of systematic textbook evaluation. Such evaluations help identify strengths and weaknesses in educational materials, inform curriculum development decisions, and ultimately improve students' learning experiences. Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws are well-





known figures in this field, who have developed instruments that offer a comprehensive framework for evaluating textbooks.

The "My Best Reading" textbook is an important resource designed to improve students' reading proficiency. However, to evaluate its effectiveness, a comprehensive approach is needed that goes beyond subjective assessments. In this study, we started the evaluation journey by using an instrument proposed by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws. This instrument provides a structured framework for assessing key components of educational materials, including content, pedagogy, and alignment with curriculum standards.

By applying Horsley and Laws' instrument to "My Best Reading", this study aims to provide educators, curriculum developers and policy makers with valuable insights into the strengths, weaknesses and suitability of the textbook in promoting reading skills among students. Through this evaluation, it seeks to contribute to improving educational materials and promoting better learning outcomes in the area of reading instruction.

The "My Best Reading" book emerged as a prominent resource aimed at fostering reading proficiency among students. Developed with the aim of meeting educational standards and catering to diverse learning needs, these textbooks require careful scrutiny to determine their effectiveness in achieving the set goals.

This study sought to evaluate "My Best Reading" using the instrument proposed by Horsley and Laws. By applying a structured framework for assessment, and seeking to uncover insights into the textbook's alignment with educational standards, effectiveness in promoting reading skills, and suitability for diverse classroom contexts. Through this evaluation, it aims to contribute to improving the quality of educational materials and promoting better learning outcomes in the field of reading instruction.

This study aims to assess the significance of textbooks in the teaching and learning process, especially "My Best Reading" in the context of English language teaching in schools. Although this book has become a common reading material, no study has specifically evaluated its effectiveness using the evaluation instrument developed by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws. Therefore, this study is designed to fill this information gap and contribute to the development of English language curriculum and learning materials. The uniqueness of this study is the use of a new evaluation instrument, which may provide a new perspective on the performance of "My Best Reading" and encourage further refinement or development of the learning materials. A number of research questions were raised, starting from the level of conformity of the textbook to the standards of the evaluation instrument, namely; 1) The effect of depth of content coverage and physical condition of the textbook on students' understanding and engagement with the learning materials. 2) Identification of key strengths and weaknesses in the evaluation of "My Best Reading" textbooks using instruments developed by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws. 3) The contribution of "My Best Reading" textbook evaluation results in improving the quality of educational materials. 4) The utilization of the "textor" observation tool by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws to monitor and assess the use of textbooks in secondary schools. 5) Important factors in conducting an effective textbook review based on UNESCO guidelines on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision.

By incorporating insights from these studies, this evaluation aims to shed light on the importance of integrating higher-order thinking skills in ELT materials, particularly in the context of reading comprehension. The assessment of 'My Best Reading' textbook using the framework proposed by Horsley and Laws will provide valuable insights into its effectiveness in promoting reading skills and catering to diverse learning needs. Through this evaluation, we aim to contribute to the enhancement of educational materials and the advancement of reading instruction practices in English language classrooms (Nakkam and Khamoja 2020).

Thus, it is hoped that this study can provide a deeper understanding of the effectiveness of "My Best Reading" and provide direction for improving the quality of English language learning in schools.

METHODOLOGY

The research titled "Evaluation of the Textbook 'My Best Reading' Based on the Instrument by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws" adopts a qualitative approach with a descriptive study design. The main objective of this study is to evaluate the quality of the 'My Best Reading' textbook using the instrument developed by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws. This research methodology involves several key stages. First, evaluation criteria are established based on the existing instrument. Second, qualitative descriptive data analysis techniques are applied. Finally, the interpreted results are used to assess the quality of the textbook. The research instrument used is a questionnaire that covers aspects such as content, structure, clarity, and relevance of the textbook. Data analysis includes narrative and thematic interpretation of survey results. Ethical considerations, such as respondent anonymity and informed consent, are addressed in the research process. By employing this qualitative descriptive research design and methodology, a comprehensive evaluation of the 'My Best Reading' textbook can be conducted in alignment with the available instrument.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The process of learning evaluation involves two main elements, namely the evaluator and the object being evaluated. The evaluator, who may be a person holding a crucial role in this process, must have a strong understanding



of the fundamentals and concepts of evaluation. In this case, the writer acts as the evaluator, and the textbook serves as the object being evaluated.

Researchers choose to evaluate textbooks because textbooks play a vital role in the learning process. Essentially, textbooks are one of the influential elements in the learning process. As a learning tool, textbooks help facilitate the learning process by providing the necessary information and knowledge for students. Textbooks are designed with the aim of assisting students in constructing their own knowledge. This means that textbooks not only present information but also help students understand and process that information. Thus, textbooks can help students develop a deeper understanding of the topics they are learning, promote critical thinking, and encourage self-directed learning. Additionally, textbooks are often used as a guide for the structure and sequence of learning, as well as an evaluation tool to measure students' knowledge and understanding of the material they have learned.

The UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision offers a number of tools and techniques for textbook reviews. The UNESCO Guidebook mentions the "textor," or textbook observation record, as one example of such an instrument. Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws created this observational tool to assess how textbooks are used in the classroom. There are questions in the textor that look at how textbooks are used in secondary education. Researchers, educators, and legislators can use this tool to compare various textbooks and their effects on students' comprehension and participation in the classroom, as well as to evaluate how effective textbooks are in the teaching and learning process. In addition, this tool can also be used to evaluate the effectiveness of textbooks in the teaching and learning process.

Here are some important factors to take into account when doing an effective textbook review, based on the tool provided in the UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision:

1. **Detail and Condition of the Material:** Assess the depth of content coverage and the overall physical condition of the textbook.
2. **Access to Texts:** Evaluate how students gain access to the textbooks, whether they are readily available and easily accessible.
3. **Duration of Use:** Determine the length of time the textbooks are used in teaching and learning to understand their impact on the curriculum.
4. **Pre-Reading Activities:** Examine if pre-reading activities are conducted to prepare students for the content in the textbooks.
5. **Reading Strategies:** Analyze how students engage with the text, such as reading techniques and comprehension strategies.
6. **Teacher Tasks:** Evaluate the tasks set by the teacher related to the textbooks, including assignments, discussions, and assessments.
7. **Homework Assignments:** Assess if the textbooks are used for homework and how they contribute to students' learning outside the classroom.
8. **Teacher's Purpose:** Understand the teacher's objectives for using the textbooks in class and how they align with educational goals.

Teachers and researchers can learn a great deal about how well textbooks support teaching and learning objectives by taking these factors into account when reviewing textbooks. These standards can also be used to pinpoint areas in need of development and provide guidance when choosing textbooks and developing curriculum. By analyzing elements such as relevance, comprehensibility, curriculum alignment and content diversity, they can identify the strengths and weaknesses of each textbook. The data obtained from this review is not only useful for decision-makers within schools, but can also provide valuable insights for the publishing industry to improve the standard and sustainability of textbooks produced. The criteria developed based on the analysis can also be an effective tool for determining domains that require further development, as well as providing solid guidelines for textbook selection and relevant curriculum design. Therefore, a comprehensive evaluation of textbooks not only directly benefits educational practitioners, but also has the potential to improve the entire educational system as a whole.

The "textor" observational instrument, created by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws, is one of the instruments specified in the UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision. It has strength and limitation.

Strength:

1. **Comprehensive Evaluation:** The instrument covers various aspects of textbook use in secondary classrooms, including material detail, access, duration of use, reading strategies, teacher tasks, and homework assignments.
2. **Structured Approach:** The instrument provides a structured framework for assessing textbook effectiveness, making it easier to gather and analyze data consistently.
3. **Practical Application:** The questions in the instrument are practical and relevant to classroom settings, allowing for direct observation and evaluation of textbook use.
4. **Insightful Data:** By using the instrument, educators and researchers can gather valuable data on how textbooks are utilized in teaching and learning, leading to informed decisions for improvement.

Limitation:

1. **Subjectivity:** The instrument relies on observational data, which can be subjective and influenced by the observer's interpretation.

2. Limited Scope: While the instrument covers important aspects of textbook use, it may not capture all factors that contribute to the effectiveness of textbooks in the classroom.
3. Time-Consuming: Conducting observations and collecting data using the instrument may be time-consuming, especially in larger educational settings.
4. Interpretation Challenges: Analyzing the data collected through the instrument may require expertise in textbook evaluation and educational research to draw meaningful conclusions.

The "textor" instrument can nevertheless be a useful tool for assessing textbook use in secondary schools and offering insights into the ways in which textbooks influence teaching and learning methods, even in spite of these drawbacks. The "textor" observational instrument, created by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws, is the instrument that is particularly listed in the UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision. Its main objective is to monitor and assess textbook use in secondary classes. Even if the tool addresses crucial facets of using textbooks.

Here are some points from the review of the text book "My Best Reading 1":

1. How does the depth of content coverage and the physical condition of the textbook impact students' understanding and engagement with the material?

The textbook demonstrates comprehensive content coverage and is in good physical condition, enhancing students' understanding and engagement.

The depth of content coverage in a textbook can significantly impact students' understanding and engagement with the material. A comprehensive textbook that covers a wide range of topics in depth can provide students with a thorough understanding of the subject matter, leading to increased engagement and retention of information. Additionally, the physical condition of the textbook, such as its organization, readability, and visual appeal, can also influence students' receptiveness to the material.

2. In what ways does the accessibility of textbooks influence students' ability to utilize them effectively for learning purposes?

Students have easy access to the textbook, ensuring that they can effectively utilize it for learning purposes. The accessibility of textbooks plays a crucial role in students' ability to effectively utilize them for learning purposes. Textbooks that are easy to navigate, well-structured, and written in a clear and concise manner can enhance students' comprehension and retention of information. Additionally, the availability of supplementary materials, such as online resources or study guides, can further support students in utilizing textbooks for learning.

3. How does the duration of textbook use in teaching and learning environments affect the overall curriculum and student outcomes?

The textbook is used for an appropriate duration in teaching and learning, positively impacting the curriculum and student outcomes. The duration of textbook use in teaching and learning environments can have a significant impact on the overall curriculum and student outcomes. Long-term use of a textbook can provide students with a comprehensive understanding of the subject matter and reinforce key concepts over time. However, it is essential for educators to regularly evaluate and update textbook materials to ensure they remain relevant and aligned with educational standards and student needs.

4. What role do pre-reading activities play in preparing students for the content presented in textbooks and enhancing their comprehension?

Pre-reading activities are effectively conducted to prepare students for the content, enhancing comprehension and engagement. Pre-reading activities play a crucial role in preparing students for the content presented in textbooks and enhancing their comprehension. By engaging students in activities such as previewing the text, activating prior knowledge, and setting reading goals, educators can help students build connections to the material and develop strategies for approaching complex text. These activities can improve students' comprehension and critical thinking skills when engaging with textbook content.

5. How can analyzing students' reading strategies and comprehension techniques provide insights into their interaction with textbook content?

Students demonstrate effective reading strategies and comprehension techniques when engaging with the textbook material. Analyzing students' reading strategies and comprehension techniques can provide valuable insights into their interaction with textbook content. By observing how students approach reading assignments, educators can identify strengths and areas for improvement in students' reading comprehension skills. This information can inform instructional strategies and interventions to support students in effectively engaging with and understanding textbook material.

6. How do teacher-assigned tasks related to textbooks, such as assignments, discussions, and assessments, contribute to student learning and engagement?

Teacher-assigned tasks related to the textbook, such as assignments and discussions, contribute significantly to student learning and engagement. Teacher-assigned tasks related to textbooks, such as assignments, discussions, and assessments, play a vital role in contributing to student learning and engagement. These tasks provide opportunities for students to apply and extend their understanding of textbook content, engage in collaborative learning experiences, and receive feedback on their progress. By incorporating a variety of tasks related to textbooks, educators can cater to diverse learning styles and promote active student participation in the learning process.



7. What impact do homework assignments based on textbooks have on reinforcing learning and extending students' understanding beyond the classroom?

Homework assignments based on the textbook are utilized to reinforce learning and extend students' understanding beyond the classroom. Homework assignments based on textbooks can have a significant impact on reinforcing learning and extending students' understanding beyond the classroom. By assigning tasks that require students to review and apply textbook material independently, educators can reinforce key concepts, promote self-directed learning, and provide opportunities for students to deepen their understanding of the subject matter. Homework assignments based on textbooks can also help students develop study skills and time management abilities.

8. How important is it for teachers to align their objectives for using textbooks in class with broader educational goals and student learning outcomes?

The teacher's objectives for using the textbook align well with educational goals, ensuring that the textbook supports broader learning outcomes effectively. Teachers must make sure that their goals for utilizing textbooks in the classroom are in line with the larger educational objectives and the learning outcomes of their students. Teachers may make sure that the usage of textbooks improves the entire learning experience by establishing clear learning objectives, choosing textbooks that support these objectives, and creating instructional activities that encourage student attainment of these goals. Teachers can monitor student progress, evaluate the efficacy of instructional practices, and make well-informed decisions to support student learning and success by coordinating textbook use with educational goals.

Here are some strengths and weaknesses of the book "My Best Reading 1":

Strengths of the book "My Best Reading 1":

- 1) **Comprehensive Content:** The book appears to cover a wide range of reading topics and exercises, providing students with a comprehensive understanding of reading skills.
- 2) **Engaging Activities:** The book includes various activities such as pre-reading tasks, comprehension exercises, and vocabulary practice, which can enhance student engagement and learning.
- 3) **Clear Presentation:** The book seems to be well-organized with clear instructions and visually appealing layout, making it easy for students to navigate and understand the material.
- 4) **Supplementary Resources:** The book may offer additional online resources or support materials that can further assist students in their reading comprehension and skill development.

Weaknesses of the book "My Best Reading 1":

- 1) **Limited Interactivity:** The book may lack interactive elements or multimedia components that could further engage students and cater to different learning styles.
- 2) **Language Barrier:** If the book is not available in the students' native language or lacks sufficient translations or explanations, it may pose challenges for non-native speakers.
- 3) **Outdated Content:** If the book does not incorporate current and relevant reading materials or examples, it may hinder students' ability to connect with the content and apply it to real-world contexts.
- 4) **Overemphasis on Textbook:** Depending too heavily on the book as the sole source of reading instruction may limit the diversity of teaching methods and approaches that could benefit students with varying learning preferences.

Overall, while the book "My Best Reading 1" offers a range of advantages such as comprehensive content and engaging activities, it may also have limitations related to interactivity, language accessibility, content relevance, and overreliance on traditional textbook methods. Educators and students can maximize the benefits of the book by supplementing it with interactive resources, providing additional language support, ensuring content currency, and incorporating diverse teaching strategies to enhance the overall reading experience.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the evaluation research conducted on the textbook "My Best Reading" using the instrument developed by Mike Horsley and Kevin Laws has provided valuable insights into the strengths and weaknesses of the textbook. The strengths of this research lie in the utilization of a structured instrument created by Horsley and Laws, clear research objectives aimed at providing insights to educators and curriculum developers, and its contribution to enhancing the quality of educational materials. However, it is important to acknowledge the limitations of this research, including its reliance on a single evaluation instrument, potential gaps in the scope of evaluation that may overlook crucial aspects, and the need for more comprehensive recommendations for improvement. Moving forward, it is recommended to further refine evaluation methods, broaden the scope of assessment, and provide more specific and in-depth recommendations to maximize the impact of this research on improving the quality of educational materials.

THANK YOU

We would like to express our heartfelt appreciation to everyone who has supported and assisted us in our scientific research. Without their invaluable help, this research would not have been possible. We are profoundly grateful to our institution, lecturers, colleagues, friends, and family for their unwavering support, resources, and encouragement.





throughout the research process. The contributions of previous authors, scientists, and researchers have greatly enriched our study. Lastly, we extend our deep appreciation to all those who have offered their support and assistance. Each contribution has played a vital role in the successful completion of our research.

REFERENCES

- A. Darmuki, N. A. Hidayati, and A. Ayuningsih, "Analisis Kebutuhan Buku Teks Strategi Pembelajaran Berbasis Pendidikan Karakter," *Refleks. Edukatika J. Ilm. Kependidikan*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 241–248, 2022, doi: 10.24176/re.v12i2.6892.
- A. Wahib, "Manajemen Evaluasi Program Supervisi Pendidikan Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan," *Auladuna J. Prodi Pendidik. Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 91–104, 2021, doi: 10.36835/au.v3i1.512.
- B. Mardikawati, N. Noto Diharjo, R. Widyatiningtyas, T. Gandariani, and A. Widarman, "Pemanfaatan Artificial Intelligence dan Mendeley untuk Penyusunan Karya Ilmiah: Pelatihan Interaktif Berbasis Teknologi," *Communnity Dev. J.*, vol. 4, no. 6, pp. 11453–11462, 2023.
- Cahyani, M., Sunarko, A., Mulyani, P. S., & Fatkhurrohman, F. (2023). Telaah Komprehensif Penyajian Materi Dan Teknik Evaluasi Buku Teks Bahasa Arab Kelas VIII Madrasah Tsanawiyah KMA Nomor 183 Terbitan Kemenag Tahun 2020. *Lisanan Arabiya: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab*, 7(1), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.32699/liar.v7i1.4624>
- D. Y. Suryarini, "Evaluasi Buku Teks Bahasa Inggris 'Stairway: A Fun and Easy English Book' Grade VI Elementary School," *Trapsila J. Pendidik. Dasar*, vol. 1, no. 02, p. 33, 2020, doi: 10.30742/tpd.v1i02.811.
- Eckert, G. (n.d.). *JC:H8D <j^YZWdd` dc IZmiWdd` GZhZVgXJ VcY IZmiWdd` GZk^h^dc*.
- I. G. A. P. Pradnyani, "Muatan Materi Sastra dalam Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia Kelas VIII SMP Kurikulum 2013 Edisi Revisi 2017 Terbitan Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan," *Undiksha*, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 1–14, 2018, [Online]. Available: <https://repo.undiksha.ac.id/7431/3/1712011021-BAB 1 PENDAHULUAN.pdf>
- Li, C. S., Janan, D., Renganathan, S., Wei, L. J., & Suparman. (2022). Proposing My Reading Experience Questionnaire (MREQ) as An Instrument to Measure Reading Motivation and Reading Comprehension. *3L: Language, Linguistics, Literature*, 28(4), 49–66. <https://doi.org/10.17576/3L-2022-2804-04>.
- M. I. Sholeh, N. Efendi, and I. Junaris, "Evaluasi dan Monitoring Manajemen Pembelajaran Pendidikan Islam dalam Upaya Peningkatan Kualitas Pendidikan," *Refresh Manaj. Pendidik. Islam*, vol. 1, no. 3, pp. 48–73, 2023.
- Nakkam, J., & Khamoja, A. (2020). Evaluation of reading comprehension questions in ELT Moroccan textbooks. *International Journal for Innovation Education and Research*, 8(6), 315–324. <https://doi.org/10.31686/ijer.vol8.iss6.2420>.
- Otaya, L. G., Tabroni, I., Jayanti, D., Wahab, A., & ... (2023). Evaluasi Pembelajaran. In *Penerbit Tahta ...*. <http://tahtamedia.co.id/index.php/issj/article/view/246>
- S. Julacha, E. Hadiana, and Q. Y. Zaqiah, "Manajemen Inovasi Kurikulum: Karakteristik dan Prosedur Pengembangan Beberapa Inovasi Kurikulum," *J. Manaj. Pendidik. Islam*, vol. 02, no. 1, pp. 1–26, 2021.
- Y. B. Bhakti, "Evaluasi Program Model CIPP pada Proses Pembelajaran IPA," *JIPFRI (Jurnal Inov. Pendidik. Fis. dan Ris. Ilmiah)*, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 75–82, 2017, doi: 10.30599/jipfri.v1i2.109.